

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING

BROOKLYN CITY COUNCIL

December 27, 2005

7:00 p.m.

The Mayor, Council and all in attendance recited the Pledge of Allegiance.

President Albier: "Mr. Fisk, would you call the roll please?"

Clerk Fisk: "Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Here."
Councilman J. Frey: "Here."
Councilman Albier: "Here."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Here."
Councilwoman Brown: "Here."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Here."
Councilman G. Frey: "Here."

President Albier: "Tonight's agenda. We have a rather lengthy agenda. We have one resolution and 11 ordinances. Resolution 2005-19, Honoring Councilman Thomas E. Coyne; Ordinance 2005-40, the second reading, Authorizing the Mayor of the City of Brooklyn to enter into a contract with the International Association of Fire Fighters Local 1145; Ordinance 2005-43, the third reading, Temporary Appropriations; Ordinance 2005-46, the second reading, Amended Annual Appropriations; Ordinance 2005-47, Amended, second reading, Authorizing the Mayor of the City of Brooklyn, Ohio to pay additional compensation for 2005 to the City of Brooklyn Municipal Foreman and Laborers Union Local 1099; Ordinance 2005-48, Amended, its second reading; Authorizing the Mayor of the City of Brooklyn, Ohio to pay an additional compensation to 2005 to the City of Brooklyn AFSCME Ohio Council 8, AFL-CIO Local 3218; Ordinance 2005-49, Amended, second reading, Authorizing the Mayor of the City of Brooklyn, Ohio to pay additional compensation for 2005 to the positions of Civil Service Commission, Building Commissioner, Director of Public Service, General Foreman, Fire Chief, Police Chief, Recreation Manager, Coordinator of Senior Services, Administrative Assistant to the Mayor, Executive Secretary to the Mayor, Director of Law, the Mayor's Court Magistrate, Prosecutor and Finance Director; Ordinance 2005-50, second reading, Authorizing the Mayor to enter into an agreement with Local Government Services Division of the State Auditor's Office to provide services to the City of Brooklyn; Ordinance 2005-51, Authorizing inter-fund transfers and advances during 2005; Ordinance 2005-52, Authorizing the execution of a Master Tax Exempt lease/purchase agreement between Key Municipal Finance, a division of Key Corporate Capital, Inc., as lessor, and the City of Brooklyn, as lessee; Ordinance 2005-54, Establishing fees for teams registering to compete in the adult softball league through the Brooklyn Recreation Department; Ordinance 2005-55, the first reading, Enacting Chapter 1360 of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Brooklyn, Ohio entitled Chapter 1360 Property Maintenance and Rental Licensing Code; and other matters that may come before the Council. We'll now have the approval of the minutes of November 28, 2005. We need a motion."

Councilwoman Brown: "Move to approve."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Second."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To approve the minutes of November 28th, Tom Coyne." Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
"John Frey." Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
"Rich Albier." Councilman Albier: "Yea."
"Kathy Pucci." Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
"Rita Brown." Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
"Colleen Gallagher." Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
"Greg Frey." Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albier: "We now have the public session. Anybody that has anything to say for the good and welfare of the City of Brooklyn, please come forward and state your name and address."

Shirley Palumbo: "Shirley Palumbo, 10218 Micka Drive, Brooklyn. I'm here to announce that the Brooklyn Animal Shelter has received their letter of determination of tax exempt status from the IRS, and

that means that donations made to us since our effective date of exemption, December 27, 2004, are tax deductible for the tax year 2005. I would also like to thank you Councilman Tom Coyne for your generosity towards Brooklyn Animal Shelter, and your support and your advice and your encouragement, all your help and your dedicated service of 28 years to the City. It inspires me to keep on working to achieve my goals. Thank you."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you Shirley. You've done a great job in getting BAS started."

President Balbier: "Anyone else?"

Ivan Dockery: "Good evening everybody, and happy holidays to everyone. I'm glad to see my favorite curmudgeon back on the desk up there. Glad you're feeling better. My name is Ivan Dockery. I've owned a home on Northcliff Avenue for over 42 years. I've been a resident of Brooklyn since 1955. In those 50 years I formed a deeply held respect for this city and for the people who live here. Time and again the people of this town have risen to the challenge to support actions and policies that have shaped the development of the entire community. Building schools, city infrastructure, municipal buildings, recreation facilities, and more recently, taxing themselves for an emergency school levy and a new fire station. Five years ago we entered a new century and a new millennium, and with the help and participation of the citizens of Brooklyn, and a commitment to the adoption and implementation of a city Master Plan, we will soon enter a new era of renewal and prosperity. On January 19th, less than a month from now, a finished Master Plan will be presented for public discussion. If you only attend one public meeting in your lifetime, this should be the one you should attend. It will be held at 6:00 p.m. at the Senior Citizen Center on Memphis Avenue. There will be plenty of free parking in the recreation area lot behind City Hall. After this meeting the plan will be finalized and presented to City Council for adoption. Please plan to attend this important meeting. Thank you."

President Balbier: "Thank you Mr. Dockery. Anyone else?"

Ron Neic: "Yes, my name is Ron Niece, I live at 8951 Pepper Ridge Drive. I am up here today to give my heartfelt thanks to the Brooklyn safety forces. This past Friday evening I was at home watching TV with my six year-old daughter, she was in her older sister's room playing when she started to scream. I jumped up to find that she had an eight-inch long wire necklace sticking out of her hand. When I tried to pull it out it would not move. The end was shaped like a fish hook, a very thin piece of metal. Your first reaction is panic. My daughter is screaming and scared and wants Mommy. My wife is a registered nurse and was working the night shift at the Cleveland Clinic. I immediately called Brooklyn Fire and Rescue. They arrived in minutes and comforted her, but found that they didn't want to chance pulling it out and chance any further damage. They cut it to about three inches long and transported her to Parma Hospital. They comforted her to the point where she was telling them what she wanted for Christmas, which in turn comforted my emotions, since I did not know what was in store for her at the hospital. It wasn't an easy process, but the doctor managed to pull it out, and then x-rayed her hand to make sure nothing broke off. It turned out good. They did not need to cut open her hand, and there was no damage done. This experience brought back memories to December 11, 2000. I went in her room that morning to check on her, she was one year-old, maybe not even one at that time, and to change her diaper. She seemed tired. I brought her downstairs and laid her back down. She just seemed tired to me. At that moment my wife walked in from working the night shift. I told her Erica seemed tired, and she immediately picked her up, and my daughter's head flopped to the side like rag doll. It was the scariest moment I ever experienced. Brooklyn Fire and Rescue was on the site in minutes. They didn't waste a second in getting her to the hospital, and seconds counted in this situation. After numerous tests, one after another, by the team of doctors and specialists, we will never know why her blood sugar dropped that low that morning, since she had her proper drinks and nutrition before bed. She just seemed tired to me that morning. I didn't assess it. I thank God my wife immediately assessed it. And for the Brooklyn Fire and Rescue for their experience and knowledge for not wasting a second. I'll forever be grateful to them. They were my heroes before 9/11/2001 tragedy in New York. If you live in Brooklyn and are fortunate enough to never have to use our safety forces, that's great. But if you ever do, I can assure you that you are in good hands. These people do much more than put out fires. I did not get the names of the two men this past Friday, but to them and the Brooklyn Fire and Rescue, I salute you. And to the Mayor and Council, thank you for this opportunity to come up here. I wish you and your family happy holidays."

President Balbier: "Thank you Mr. Niece."

Mayor Patton: "Thank you Mr. Niecee."

President Balbier: "Chief Duchoslav, would you pass that on to your men?"

Chief Duchoslav: "I certainly will."

President Balbier: "Anyone else care to speak? Then we'll move onto reports from committees, commissions and boards. The first is the Public Works Committee, and it's chaired by Mr. Greg Frey."

Councilman G. Frey: "Mr. Balbier, I really have no report tonight other than I believe the fire station is pretty much on hiatus until the weather improves in the spring; although there is work being done to make sure that supplies are going to be available, the contracts are signed, that everything's in place to go when the weather does break. And at that time we will, I'm sure, have some more Public Works meetings to determine what our process is from there."

President Balbier: "Thank you Mr. Frey. Next is Public Safety and that's chaired by Mrs. Kathleen Pucci."

Councilwoman Pucci: "No report this evening."

President Balbier: "Thank you Mrs. Pucci. The Planning Commission, that's chaired by Mr. John Frey."

Councilman J. Frey: "Thank you Mr. Balbier. There was a meeting of the Planning Commission on December 1st. I was not in attendance, but at that meeting I have a report they passed approval for Boyer Signs, Zoresta Equipment, at 8500 Clinton Road, just signage. On North cliff at Ridge Park Square there was sign approval for additional tenant signage for the property located at 4800 Ridge Road. The additional signage will be located on the pole sign located in front of the Cici's Pizza. Also at that meeting, Ronald Gaynor requested an addition of a tower, fiber tower, at 11240 Brookpark Road. That was a disk for, I believe, cell phone operation on the same tower that now exists there. And then, I might mention that there is a Planning Commission meeting for Thursday, January 5th, in the Mayor's Court at Brooklyn City Hall for the following items: There's a request from Brookpark Road LLC for a lot split for MC Machine Company located at 9000 Brookpark Road; there's a request from HSB Architects for St. Elias Church to construct a 70 square foot addition to install an elevator in the existing church located at 8023 Memphis Avenue; and general business. And that's the report of the Planning Commission."

President Balbier: "Thank you Mr. Frey. Next is the Rec Board, I'm chairman of that. We had our last meeting on December 5th, and I gave that report at the last Council meeting. The next meeting of the Rec Board will be January 30th at 6:30 in the Mayor's Court. Next is the Finance Committee, and that's Mrs. Kathleen Pucci."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Thank you Mr. Balbier. The Finance Committee met earlier this evening and approved the following legislation: Ordinance 2005-40, which is on second reading, Authorizing the Mayor to enter into a contract with the International Association of Fire Fighters Local 1145; 2005-43, which is third reading, the Temporary Appropriations for 2006; 2005-46, which is second reading, Amended Annual Appropriations for 2005; 2005-47, Authorizing the Mayor to pay additional compensation for 2005 to the Municipal Foreman and Laborers Union Local 1099. And I do want to make a comment about this and the next two. I had actually a call from a resident today about this. There still seems to be some misunderstanding about the original use of the word bonus. The resident who called me was under the impression that the additional compensation is actually a bonus on top of a raise. So just to reiterate to everybody, these were two unions that agreed not to take a raise in 2005 because of the financial forecast, and because revenues did come in at higher than they were initially projected, these two unions, plus our non-bargained for employees, this is additional compensation, it is not a bonus on top of a raise that they already got. They did not get a raise for 2005. 2005-48 is the additional compensation for AFSCME Ohio Council 8 AFL-CIO Local 3218; 2005-49 is additional compensation for the non-bargained for employees; 2005-50, Authorizing the Mayor to enter into an agreement with Local Government Services, which is a division of the State Auditor's office; 2005-51, Authorizing inter-fund transfers and advances for 2005; 2005-52, Authorizing the tax exempt lease/purchase agreement between Key Municipal Finance and the city, this is for our new aerial ladder truck; 2005-54, Establishing fees for teams in the adult softball league,

we're raising them this year; and 2005-51 (55), which will be first reading, is the Property Maintenance and Rental License Code. We also received information from Mr. Fisk. The projected revenue as of today for 2005 is \$14.150 million, and the projected expenditures 14.165, and the projected carry-over for the General Fund is 1.85 million to 1.9, and the projected carry-over for the Capital Improvement Fund is about 1.263 million. That completes my report, thank you Mr. Albier."

President Albier: "Thank you Mrs. Pucci. Next is Domestic Violence and Legislative Update, and that's Mrs. Colleen Gallagher."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Thank you Mr. Albier. A Domestic Violence meeting was held December 14th at 6:30 p.m. Our Committee welcomed our newest member, Ruth Scarborough. Members wanted to address specific issues such as sensitivity training for police and fire, communication between our Police Department, and utilization of the city's newsletter for updates. We also discussed looking into a design contest for our Domestic Abuse brochure involving local high school students, possibly reward being a college savings bond. We also had discussions on elder abuse and recent data. According to the best available estimates, between one and two million Americans age 65 or older have been injured, exploited or otherwise mistreated by someone of whom they depended or cared for for protection. Estimates of the frequency of elder abuse range from 2% to 10%, based on various sampling survey methods and case definitions. Data on elder abuse in domestic settings suggests that one in 14 incidents, excluding incidents of self-neglect, comes to the attention of authority. Current estimates put the overall reporting of financial exploitation at only one in 25 cases, suggesting that there may be at least five million financial abuse victims each year. It is estimated that for every one case of elder abuse, neglect, exploitation or self-neglect reported to authorities, about five more go unreported. Our Committee will be meeting again February 8, 2006 at 6:30 p.m. to discuss more information regarding elder abuse. And our thanks goes out to those who donated old cell phones for the Domestic Abuse Awareness Month. Thank you Mr. Albier."

President Albier: "Thank you Mrs. Gallagher. Next is the Zoning Board of Appeals, and that would be Mr. Ockington."

Comm. Ockington: "Thank you Mr. Albier. There was only one applicant for the December meeting, and they deferred, so the meeting was postponed to January 19th."

President Albier: "Thank you. That completes the reports from committees, next is the reports of Council, and appropriately we start off tonight with Mr. Thomas Coyne."

Councilman Tom Coyne: "Thank you Mr. Albier. Mayor, this evening I had a request or an inquiry from a resident about the street east of the Westbrook, the houses in the street, between there and the new proposed firehouse. Is that a dedicated street?"

Mayor Patton: "I'm not certain which street you're talking of."

Councilman G. Frey: "Where the doubles are?"

Councilman Coyne: "Where the doubles are. Between the new fire house planned and..."

Councilwoman Pucci: "The duplexes."

Mayor Patton: "I don't believe that is a dedicated street, no."

Councilman Coyne: "Okay, but our garbage trucks collect garbage but they don't snowplow. Is there a reason we do one-half, we do part of our services and we don't do part of our services?"

Mayor Patton: "That's exactly duplicate service what we supply Brooklyn Acres, and we go through undedicated streets there also."

Councilman Coyne: "Okay, so they don't plow the Brooklyn Acres and they do collect garbage."

Mayor Patton: "No."

Councilman Coyne: "Okay, the resident asked, and I wasn't sure what the correct answer was."

Mayor Patton: "Okay."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you. And thank you to the residents who go above and beyond contributing to making Brooklyn a better place to live. And I'm talking here about Shirley Palumbo and Ivan Dockery and all the residents that come up at these meetings at public sessions and have a lot to offer. I know both of these individuals work very hard at what they're doing. The Brooklyn Animal Shelter with Shirley, and Ivan Dockery with the Northcliff Coalition. We thank you for all your work in those endeavors. I'd like to thank all the residents of Brooklyn for their support over the last 28 years. I thoroughly enjoyed representing the fine people of Brooklyn. It's been an honor and a privilege to serve this community. Thank you all again for allowing me to serve, and I wish everyone a very happy new year. And last but not least, to my wife and my kids and my family. I know I've made a lot of schedule changes and a lot of last minute changes to accommodate Council in the different things that go on in the city, and I appreciate all their accommodating of me. Thank you again. Thank you all."

President Albier: "Thank you Mr. Coyne. Next is Mr. John Frey."

Councilman John Frey: "Thank you Mr. Albier. Well many of you know I had a little injury December 1st or 2nd, and it was in an altercation with a cat. I wasn't attacked by the cat, I was helping my daughter-in-law park her car in the garage of a place that we were staying at Hilton Head. We were on vacation. A cat wouldn't get away from me. It kept walking between my legs, around my legs, pretty soon it started to try to crawl up the pantleg. And I didn't want to step on this small cat. And in so doing I made a move to get away from it, and as you all know, I have artificial hips, and I lose balance, and I went down on my forehead. And I was pretty well scarred up. But I wasn't attacked, Kathy, by a cat. I was trying to not step on the thing. I'm sorry I didn't step on it. And talking about response by the 9-1-1 people, my daughter-in-law called 9-1-1, three paramedics showed up. I was bleeding quite profusely from the forehead, nose, a chunk of my nose, and pretty scarred up. But that was almost a month ago, and it's pretty well healed. No pain, just a lot of blood lost, and a lot of aggravation, and a lot of laughs. I wasn't laughing, but everybody that saw me was laughing. But you'd be amazed at how congenial people are when they see you're injured. I was driving home from Hilton Head, stopped in a Sleep Inn, Sleep Inn in No. Carolina on the W. Virginia turnpike, and people hauled my luggage from my car, they scraped the ice off of my windshield. I couldn't do anything. They just did everything for you because they realized something happened to this guy. When they looked at me, and you could see that they were wondering, what's the matter with that guy, you should see the other guy. In any event, the other guy wasn't injured, he ran away. So I have nothing to report, I haven't been here this past couple of weeks. I would like to tell you that 2005 for Mary and I wasn't very good since July 5th, since she took the fall down the stairs and fractured her shoulder in a few places. So we're looking for 2006 to be a new beginning. And I want to thank everybody for all their cooperation. And the people in Brooklyn are very supportive, and I appreciate being Councilman, I enjoy it. And that's all I have to say Rich."

President Albier: "Thank you Mr. Frey. You look just as handsome as ever."

Councilman J. Frey: "Thanks."

President Rich Albier: "I hope everyone had a merry Christmas. And Chief Murphy, I noticed a article in the paper that Ford was paying \$735 to each owner of a Crown Victoria, which our police cars are, between the years of 1996 and 2001, who had to have their manifolds repaired, and I was wondering if you knew anything about that, or if we have any cars that fall in that age?"

Chief Murphy: "I saw the same article you did, and we get letters from Ford periodically on recalls, and we didn't have to have anything replaced in that area."

President Albier: "Okay, thank you. Also I would like to congratulate Mr. Coyne on his 28 years..."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you."

President Albier: "...and all that experience is going to be missed on Council."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you very much."

President Albier: "I didn't know if anybody noticed the article in the paper about Mayor's Courts, but the Brooklyn Mayor's Courts handled enough cases that they were ranked fourth in the State of Ohio in Mayor's Courts, so that's a lot of cases. Let's see what else I've got here. Also, our Charter tells us that the first meeting in the new year has to be an organizational meeting, so our first Council meeting is going to be on the 9th. So I would like to have our organizational meeting, as long as Council agrees with me, at 5:45 on that night, because then after the meeting it could give us a little time for the different committees to elect their chairpersons, and then the Finance Committee meeting will be at 6:30 and the Council meeting at 7. And that's all I have. Mrs. Pucci."

Councilwoman Kathy Pucci: "Thank you Mr. Albier. Good evening. Congratulations to Shirl Palumbo and the officers and members of the Brooklyn Animal Shelter on the tax exempt status. This group has been working tirelessly for over a year now. So congratulations Shirl, that's quite an accomplishment. And also Mr. Dockery, thank you for all you do for our community also. I too would like to encourage everyone to plan on attending the Master Plan meeting on the 19th. And Mr. Neic, thank you for your kind words about our safety forces. You're right, they do a great job. I have had occasion a few times, unfortunately, to have to call them for my youngest son, and they do make the kids feel real comfortable and they go out of their way in that area. And I'm sure, Paul, you'll pass everything along to them."

Chief Duchoslav: "Sure."

Councilwoman Pucci: "For the next meeting I'd like to, or either the next meeting or the one after that, I'd like to request that we get an analysis of the cost differential for the fire station. Now that the bids have actually been awarded and we have access to the information from the bids, so we can get a better idea where the differential was, the actual cost versus our estimates. I think January 9th might be kind of lengthy, so it might be better for the..."

President Albier: "Right."

Councilwoman Pucci: "...second meeting in January."

President Albier: "Okay."

Councilwoman Pucci: "And Mr. Kappler, a resident at 6124 Delora, apparently their sewer by the curb was never fixed to grade when the street was re-done, and I guess they had called several times in the fall, it was supposed to be done by the end of November. I realize now because of the weather it's not going to happen, but if you could give that a priority as soon as we're able to do that type of work. Are you familiar with that address?"

Director Kappler: "Yes I am, and we will get that as soon as weather permits. That can be repaired in the wintertime."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Okay. Thank you very much. And I would ask everybody to review the rules of Council for any suggested changes for 2006 so that we can discuss that at our organizational meeting on January 9th. I'd also like to welcome Tom Coyne's family here this evening. And I'd like to congratulate and thank Tom for his 28 years of dedicated service to our community. Tom, you've served our community well, always making time to talk to residents, and your support of all the community organizations. But for those of you who don't know Tom personally, Tom has what's truly important in life, and that is the love, admiration and respect and devotion of his family. So congratulations to Tom and Ursula and their family, and I wish you all well."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you very much Kathy."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Thank you Mr. Albier."

President Albier: "Thank you Mrs. Pucci. Mrs. Brown."

Councilwoman Rita Brown: "Thank you Mr. Albieri. Mayor, I received a call from a resident today, and the question was, do we give un-notified drug testing to our employees?"

Mayor Patton: "Absolutely, yes."

Councilwoman Brown: "And if not, why."

Mayor Patton: "Yes we do."

Councilwoman Brown: "We do give them."

Mayor Patton: "Yes."

Councilwoman Brown: "Okay."

Mayor Patton: "That's a mandate of the CDL driver's license, and we comply with all rules."

Councilwoman Brown: "Okay, thank you. I can inform that residents yes we do. This call from 6124 Delora sounds familiar because I've called that to you Mr. Kappler."

Director Kappler: "That is correct."

Councilwoman Brown: "And again, the resident does understand the inclement weather, the winter. But sooner or later it will be fixed for them. And now to Councilman Tom Coyne. It'll be odd not calling him Councilman any longer. Back in 1986, in November, John Coyne appointed me to the Brooklyn City Council. Tom Coyne took me under his wing. He was very kind to me, and guided me in the right direction, lead me gently when he thought I was wrong. Got a couple of violent answers from me, but that goes with the territory. Over the 28 years we have been on one side or we've been on another side, we've been at each other's throats or we have been best buddies. It has been an exhilarating experience. He has always given me good guidance. Tom, the best is yet to come for you and your family. Congratulations on your 28 years, and God bless you."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you Rita."

Councilwoman Brown: "That completes my report."

President Albieri: "Thank you Mrs. Brown. Mrs. Gallagher."

Councilwoman Colleen Gallagher: "Thank you Mr. Albieri. Good evening ladies and gentlemen. I'd like to take the opportunity to thank Councilman Tom Coyne for his 28 years of service and dedication. My sister Loretta reminded me today that when Tom first ran for City Council he didn't have the support of then Mayor John Coyne, but he was determined to work hard and win. Tom was always a good family man and was very involved with his children's activities. And more importantly he gave back to our community. I realize, entering my third term, that it takes a lot of time and determination to improve the quality of life in the City of Brooklyn. I only hope I can accomplish as much as Tom, and keep that smile, as he did for 28 years. I'd like to extend my warm wishes to Tom and his family. And I'd like to wish everyone a safe and happy new year. That completes my report Mr. Albieri."

President Albieri: "Thank you Mrs. Gallagher. Mr. Greg Frey."

Councilman Greg Frey: "Thank you Mr. Albieri. I know you don't like it when we get redundant, but I too would like to offer my congratulations to Tom on 28 years. I've been on Council for 20 years, and I've never had anybody sitting in this seat other than Tom. Mr. Patton, you need to lose 125 pounds by the next meeting. Tom has here tonight, that's not all of his family, but it's a good selection of his family. Welcome. And thank you for the giving up of your father, grandfather, husband... I don't know, are there any others out there? For him to provide service to the City of Brooklyn, and to his friends. 28 years of public service is a long stint. You do a lot of work over that kind of time, you talk to a lot of people, you try to do a lot of

things. Hopefully you move it in the right direction. And so Tom, congratulations. Thank you for your service."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you Greg."

Councilman G. Frey: "I have a couple of... Mr. Neic said some stuff that really ought to touch home for all of us. You know, we talk about our fire fighters or our policemen and what not, every once in a while the rubber really meets the road when somebody gets hurt or you need a response from EMS or from the police at an accident or something like that, and it becomes the most important thing in our lives. So we need to take the time to consider that those that respond are there every day, day in, day out, waiting for the opportunity to do the things that they do so very, very well. Chief, both Chiefs, Chief Murphy, Chief Duchoslav, kudos to your men and women, and God love them. They keep us from a lot of things that can go very wrong in our lives. Or they help us when a lot of things do go very wrong in our lives. Mr. Kappler, I called City Hall this morning, I had a problem with litter over at Brock Playground, and Mr. Kappler was in a meeting; but I left a message that, a) we need to address the litter, and maybe it's time to have a little talk with the management at Ridge Park Square, because this time of year you get a lot of wind and what not, and litter happens. And by the time I went home this afternoon, it was all cleaned up. So thank you. Thank you to your men and women for what they do day in, day out. God love all the employees of the City of Brooklyn, they do a wonderful job for us. And thank you... Mr. Fisk gave us some good news tonight. We're going to balance our books this year. We're going to go forward into 2006 with approximately \$1.9 million in our General Fund and \$1.2 million in our Capital Improvement Fund. We are the envy of all our neighbors in that. We have balanced our budgets very well over the years. We've had some tough times the last couple of years. I want to thank all the directors and all the employees for making the, and Mayor, you too, well you lead the team, but for making the tough choices to cut the budget at the beginning of the year, to take the steps that were necessary to make sure that we were fiscally responsible throughout the year. And now we go in to next year in a very good situation. We're able tonight to try and make some things right for some of our employees, and that's a good thing. That's good news for the City of Brooklyn. So kudos to all of you. And I think, let me see... That's all I've got for tonight. Thank you all. I wish you very merry Christmas and a happy new year. Hope we have health and prosperity. And Dad, I've been told time to time that it would be helpful if I could lose a chunk of my nose, so you'll have to give me some lessons."

President Albier: "Thank you Mr. Frey. That completes the reports of Council. We'll now have the Mayor's report."

Mayor Ken Patton: "Congratulations to Shirley and the tax exempt status you have reached. I hope to work with you and let the money roll in, and get Brooklyn Animal Shelter a reality. To Ivan Dockery, his publication of the Master Plan, he's a walking, talking PA system. He's spreading the news everywhere. You're doing a great job, thank you for what you do. Mr. Neic, thank you for the compliments of our safety forces. Not only our safety forces, but I'd like to thank all of our employees throughout the years. They were on budget. We've won financial awards, we had guys out snowplowing around Christmas time, the safety forces constantly are getting kudos. And thanks for the generosity of our employees, because we gave gifts to some of the residents at Thanksgiving and Christmas who really were down on their luck. So thank you for all you do, and I hope 2006 brings good things for everyone. At this time I'd like Council confirmation to reappoint to the Recreation Board Mrs. Diane Esper, Mr. Sean Francis, and Mr. Jeffery Kazimour to three year terms to expire 12/31/08."

Councilwoman Pucci: "We should probably do them one at a time?"

Mayor Patton: "One at a time Mr. Shaper?"

Director Shaper: "Yes."

Mayor Patton: "Okay. Diane Esper."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Move to approve Diane Esper for the Rec Board."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To approve Diane Esper for the Recreation Board, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."	Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
"Rich Albier."	Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
"Kathy Pucci."	Councilman Albier: "Yea."
"Rita Brown."	Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
"Colleen Gallagher."	Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
"Greg Frey."	Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
	Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Mayor Patton: "To confirm Mr. Sean Francis to Recreation Board."

Councilman Coyne: "So move."

President Albier: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To confirm Sean Francis to the Recreation Board, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."	Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
"Rich Albier."	Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
"Kathy Pucci."	Councilman Albier: "Yea."
"Rita Brown."	Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
"Colleen Gallagher."	Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
"Greg Frey."	Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
	Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Mayor Patton: "To reappoint and confirm Mr. Jeffrey Kazimour to the Recreation Board."

Councilman G. Frey: "So move."

President Albier: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To confirm Jeffrey Kazimour to the Recreation Board, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."	Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
"Rich Albier."	Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
"Kathy Pucci."	Councilman Albier: "Yea."
"Rita Brown."	Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
"Colleen Gallagher."	Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
"Greg Frey."	Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
	Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Mayor Patton: "At this time I'd also ask Council's confirmation to reappoint to the Domestic Abuse Commission Mrs. Ruth Ann Scarborough with a three-year term to expire January 1, 2009."

Councilman Coyne: "So move."

President Albier: "Second."

Councilman J. Frey: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To approve Ruth Ann Scarborough, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."	Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
"Rich Albier."	Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
"Kathy Pucci."	Councilman Albier: "Yea."
"Rita Brown."	Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
"Colleen Gallagher."	Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
"Greg Frey."	Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
	Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Mayor Patton: "To reappoint Judith Basniak to the Domestic Abuse Commission, term to expire January 1, 2009."

Councilman J. Frey: "I move we approve."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To reappoint Judith Basniak, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Mayor Patton: "To reappoint to the Domestic Abuse Commission, Mrs. Helen Wilson, three-year term to expire January 1, 2009."

Councilman Coyne: "Move to approve."

Councilman G. Frey: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To reappoint Helen Wilson to the Domestic Abuse Council, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Mayor Patton: "For our citizens' information, we still have one opening on the Fair Housing Review Board. It's a three-year term, which will expire 12/31/08. Basically it oversees the city is compliant with Fair Housing standards. Basically they only meet when there is a problem, basically once a year, if that. So if anyone is interested, please contact my office. On Sunday, January 1st at 2 p.m. at the Senior Center, the city will host a swearing-in ceremony of members of Council who were elected, and also of School Board members. Everyone is invited. Again, that's 2:00 on January 1st. I also saw the Mayor's Court information, and Brooklyn is the fourth busiest Mayor's Court in the State of Ohio, and in our region we're the second busiest in the state in our region. And it's over 5,857 citations went through our court. So that's an impressive number. Chief, please pass onto the officers good job, and we'll have to pass that onto Magistrate Albier also. Also, the Sun News published last week pertaining to the legislation before Council this evening. And I'd like to thank Councilwoman Pucci for saying that the Council said that they will approve because they want to be fair, and you don't want to punish these groups who took a zero percent raise throughout the year. A 1% raise is not even the cost of living. And the reason this happened was the employees opted for a zero percent increase in salary with the hope of maintaining the work force and not paying a portion of their health care premium, or in order to reduce a large gap originally projected between revenues and expenses in 2005. And we appreciate the sacrifice of the city employees during 2005 for that reason. The Plain Dealer published the County Treasurer's rates of taxation for years for 2005 to be paid in 2006. Brooklyn is listed as 1.62% tax as a percentage of the market. This has to do with property taxes, basically 1.62 is, times that by \$100,000 the value of a house, so you would pay \$1620. And Brooklyn is the 5th lowest tax rate in the county. So we're going to try to maintain that obviously. Thank you to Superintendent Jeff Lampert and the School Board for inviting me over to follow Ivan Dockery at the School Board meeting. And again, a very important Master Plan. It's where Brooklyn's going to go over the next 20 years. And we appreciate the efforts of Councilmen like Tom Coyne and some of the Councilmen here, the past Mayor, people that have got the city to where it is. We're making a plan, we're offering an open page to our residents to come, let's plan together. This is where we're going to go in the next 20 years, so please do attend the meeting. It's January 19th, it's a Thursday, from 6-8 p.m. Everyone who has heat in their house is probably complaining about East Ohio Gas and the cost. And residential customers usually use 20 mcf

during the month of January. And it's reported in the year 2000 20 mcf cost us \$115.89; this January it's going to cost us \$355.40. So again, try to keep your thermostats low, wear a sweatshirt or sweater, what have you. There is no relief in sight pertaining to that. Those who are available for this program, please sign up. This program is called the Home Energy Assistance Program, referred to as HEAP. You've heard us talk of this before. Apply now to help pay heating bills. New HEAP guidelines for 2005-2006 as of 10/7/05, Cuyahoga County Auditor Frank Russo has announced that more low income residents can apply for help with heating bills during the upcoming winter season. This is in anticipation of higher energy costs for the upcoming winter. To be eligible, a single person could have a total household income for 12 months of up to \$16,748. This is a new guideline as of October 25th. Please check at our Senior Center, we will help you contact the proper people. Again, the cost of heating our homes is going sky high, and you know, let's work together to keep it down. I also want to wish everyone a happy new year. And I have a Proclamation for our Councilman a little later when the proper time comes. Thank you."

President Albier: "Thank you Mayor. Next is the directors' reports, the first is the Finance Director, Mr. Fisk."

Dir. Fisk: "Thank you Mr. Albier. Just very quickly. My staff in Finance is at the end of the year finishing things up for the 2005 fiscal year. Mrs. Pucci reported on balances, etc., which is kind of a snapshot right now. And we know things will change over the four days here on a daily basis; but we will be finishing up the fiscal year and be able to certify all of our balances to the county by January 16th. And that completes my report."

President Albier: "Thank you Mr. Fisk. The Service Department, Mr. Kappler."

Director Kappler: "Thank you Mr. Albier. Tonight I have no report."

President Albier: "Thank you. The Building Department, Mr. Ockington."

Comm. Ockington: "Thank you Mr. Albier. I also have no report, but I would like to wish everybody happy new year."

President Albier: "Thank you Mr. Ockington. Police Department, Chief Murphy."

Chief Murphy: "The Police Department also has no report, and happy new year to everybody."

President Albier: "Thank you Chief. Fire Department, Chief Duchoslav."

Chief Duchoslav: "Thank you Mr. Albier. And I do have a couple comments, not necessarily a report. With the high cost of heating our homes, I can see that many residents are going to use portable space heaters. Please follow the manufacturer instructions closely, especially as to the type of fuel that you use, and clearance from combustibles. And another item that seems to crop up around this time of year is the use of candles. Candles are great for ambiance and atmosphere and things like that. A good rule of thumb, and they are causing more and more house fires. A good rule of thumb is, when you leave the room blow the candle out. Do not leave the room with a candle lit, especially if you have pets or small children. And I'd like to thank Tom Coyne in my four years up here in this seat, for your support for the Fire Department."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you Chief."

Chief Duchoslav: "That's it."

President Albier: "Thank you Chief. The Law Department, Mr. Shaper."

Director Shaper: "I want to say it's really good to see John Frey back with us. I want to thank Tom Coyne for the support and assistance he gave me, especially during the transition period. And I want to say this, it takes one week in this type of job to realize when you walk, go to an event, or drive down the street, you'll never see it the same way again as when you're doing the job as Law Director or as a Councilperson. I'm sure every time Tom Coyne drives down a street he looks at the signs, he looks to see where they're placed, he looks to see if the street's maintained. You never see it the same way. Tom, you've done it for 28 years, and

you've done an excellent job. Thank you. And I want to thank Kathy Pucci this week, who she gave me much help and much consideration. Thank you."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you."

President Albier: "Thank you Mr. Shaper."

Director Shaper: "Happy new year everybody."

President Albier: "Next is the Recreation Department, and that would be Sandy Balzer."

Mgr. Balzer: "Thank you. I just wanted to remind everybody that this week, starting tonight actually, was the Brooklyn High School Hockey Tournament, and it'll be going on the next two nights, Wednesday and Thursday. Please come down, the games are at 5:30 and 7:45, and see some great hockey. Remind everybody that our hours this Saturday are only from 8-1 p.m. and will be closed on Sunday. And then I would like to thank all the staff at the Rec and for the City of Brooklyn and Council and residents for making me feel welcome my first five months here, and I look forward to a great 2006. Happy new year everybody."

President Albier: "Thank you Sandy. That completes the directors' reports. The next portion of our meeting is audience remarks pertaining to legislation on the agenda. If anyone wishes to make a comment on the legislation now's the time to step forward. If not, we'll move on. And our first one is **RESOLUTION 2005-19**. Honoring Councilman Thomas E. Coyne. I'm going to read this in its entirety, and when I'm finished the Mayor also has a Proclamation he wishes to give Mr. Coyne. This is Resolution 2005-19. It's introduced by Pucci, Gallagher, Greg Frey, Albier, John Frey and Brown. A Resolution recognizing the dedication and achievements of Councilperson Thomas E. Coyne. Whereas, the Council of the City of Brooklyn wishes to recognize Thomas E. Coyne for serving on the Brooklyn City Council for 28 years. And whereas, Tom Coyne, personally, and as a Council representative, has always had a strong commitment to the City of Brooklyn. And whereas, Tom Coyne, personally, and as a Council representative, has always had a strong commitment to the residents of the City of Brooklyn. And whereas, Tom Coyne has manifested his commitment to the City of Brooklyn and the residents of the City of Brooklyn by serving on a number of committees and commissions, including, but not limited to, the following: Finance Committee, Public Works Committee, Recreation Board, Planning Commission, Master Plan Advisory Committee. And whereas, Tom Coyne has been involved with a number of noteworthy clubs and organizations, including, but not limited to: the Cuyahoga County Democratic Executive Committee, the Brooklyn Democratic Club, the St. Thomas More Finance Council, and the Holy Name Society, the Brooklyn City Schools PTA, the Brooklyn City Schools Technology Committee, the Brooklyn Historical Society, the Friends of the Brooklyn Library, and the Westside Irish American Club. And whereas, Tom Coyne has helped implement Brooklyn's curbside recycling program, and made substantial contributions in extending the life of the municipal landfill, and improving the environment, bringing cable television to the City of Brooklyn, and abating noise from the airport. And whereas, Tom Coyne's engineering background has been a valuable asset to the Council of Brooklyn. And whereas, Tom Coyne has at all times made himself available to the residents of the City of Brooklyn. And whereas, Tom Coyne has served the country in the military, United States Army 73rd Armored Division. And whereas, Tom Coyne has managed to do all of the above mentioned activities and achieve these accomplishments with grace, dignity and honor. And whereas, Tom Coyne has served as an excellent example of one who understands the importance of giving to the community. And whereas, Tom Coyne has often expressed his pride at the accomplishments of others who have given to the community. Now, therefore, the Council of the City of Brooklyn, County of Cuyahoga, State of Ohio. Section 1. Wish to thank Tom Coyne for the selfless dedication and leadership he has provided to the City of Brooklyn and all of its residents. Section 2. While Tom Coyne no longer will continue to serve on Council, he will remain a leader in the community and continue to be a vital part of the community. Section 3. The Council of the City of Brooklyn hereby wishes Tom Coyne and his wife, Ursula, its best wishes for all that lies ahead of them. Section 4. That this Resolution be in full force and be in effect from after the earliest period allowed by law."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Move to suspend the rules."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To suspend the rules, Tom Coyne."

Councilman Coyne: "Do I have to abstain on this?"

Clerk Fisk: "I think not."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."

Clerk Fisk: "John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."

Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."

Councilwoman Brown: "A wholehearted yea."

Clerk Fisk: "Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Clerk Fisk: "To approve, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albier: "Now the Mayor will present his Proclamation. I think you better step down there Mr. Coyne."

Mayor Patton: "Many years ago I was working over at St. Thomas More... If Ursula could come up, and the entire family please."

From audience: "Want everybody?"

Mayor Patton: "Sure. And while working there I met Tom Coyne. I wound up coaching basketball. I found out that he was the man to go to if you needed new backboards. And way back when, Tom was responsible to help get those glass backboards at St. Thomas More. And then when I was Service Director he assisted me, made me a better Service Director, and through the past six years he assisted me representing our city, and he kept me on my toes and made me a better Mayor. Tom, I thank you for that. We have a Mayor's Proclamation. To honor and recognize Councilman Thomas E. Coyne on his 28 years of service to the City of Brooklyn. Whereas, Councilman Thomas E. Coyne has served diligently on the Brooklyn City Council from January 1, 1978 until December 27, 2005. And whereas, Councilman Coyne, throughout his career in public service has lead by his passion for the community and residents. And whereas, Councilman Coyne has served four years as Council President and Pro-Tem, along with serving on the following committees and commissions: Finance, Public Works, Recreation Board, Planning Commission, and Master Plan Advisory Committee. And whereas, Councilman Coyne has been involved in a number of clubs and organizations such as the Cuyahoga County Democratic Executive Committee, the Brooklyn Democratic Club, St. Thomas More Financial Council, the Holy Name Society, Brooklyn City Schools PTA, the Brooklyn City Schools Technology Committee, Brooklyn Historical Society, Friends of the Brooklyn Library, and the Westside Irish American Club. And whereas, Councilman Coyne has helped implement the Brooklyn curbside recycling program, I remember that back in 1990, that was a tough program to get going, and made a significant contribution in extending the life of the municipal landfill and improving the environment; bringing cable television to the City of Brooklyn and abating noise from the airport. And whereas, Councilman Coyne has used his background and knowledge of engineering to assist in many projects for the City of Brooklyn, such as Natatorium pool design criteria and Senior Center design review. Now, therefore, I, Mayor Kenneth E. Patton, and on behalf of the Brooklyn City Council, and all the citizens of the City of Brooklyn, Ohio, do hereby extend sincere congratulations to Councilman Thomas E. Coyne on his 28 years of service and dedication to the City of Brooklyn, Ohio. In witness whereof, I have hereunto subscribed my name and have

caused the seal of the City of Brooklyn, Ohio to be affixed on this 27th day of December in the year of our Lord, 2005. Thank you Tom."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you Mayor. For those of you that don't know, this isn't my whole crew, that's just part of them. There's a lot of them had to go back to where they live, and because of the holiday. But thank you all. I appreciate it all."

President Albier: "Next is **ORDINANCE 2005-40**. This is supposed to be on second reading, however the Finance Committee is recommending that we pass it tonight. Authorizing the Mayor of the City of Brooklyn, Ohio to enter into a contract with the International Association of Fire Fighters Local 1145."

Councilman J. Frey: "I move it."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Introduced by all, suspend the rules."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Mr. Albier, may I be recognized?"

President Albier: "Yes Mrs. Gallagher."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "I'd like to make a motion authorizing the Mayor of the City of Brooklyn to pay full monetary reimbursement to the International Association of Fire Fighters Local 1145 for their fact finder they hired. The Fire Fighters had to go out and hire a fact finder, and they negotiated for a year, and were told that the directors and employees of Local 1099 and 3218 were not taking a pay increase. And now today all the employees are benefiting from this mediator. So I'd like to see Council or the Mayor and the City of Brooklyn reimburse Local 1145."

Councilwoman Brown: "Second."

President Albier: "Wait a minute. I think first of all, our Law Director will have to look at that and see if we can do that."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "I don't see why not."

President Albier: "Mr. Shaper."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Do we know how much it cost?"

Councilwoman Gallagher: "I think it was \$500."

Director Shaper: "I don't see a legal problem with you paying that. There certainly is no obligation. That is a move that is up to Council. It doesn't conform to how things are generally done at Council, but that's not an objection; that generally things are presented... That's up to Council to determine. I do not see any legal reason at all that that money cannot be paid."

President Albier: "Okay. Would you re-state your position Mrs. Gallagher?"

Councilwoman Gallagher: "I'd like to make a motion authorizing the Mayor of the City of Brooklyn, Ohio to pay full monetary reimbursement to the International Association of Fire Fighters Local 1145 for the fact finder they hired."

Councilwoman Brown: "And I was a second."

President Albier: "Would you call for a vote Mr. Fisk."

Councilman G. Frey: "Wait a minute, is there a dollar amount that goes with this?"

President Albrier: "Oh, yes."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "I think it was about \$500."

President Albrier: "Alright."

Mayor Patton: "Do we want a not to exceed to be put in it?"

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Not to exceed \$500."

President Albrier: "Okay, not to exceed \$500 in the motion."

Councilman G. Frey: "Okay, now can I ask a question..."

President Albrier: "Certainly."

Councilman G. Frey: "...about this, because I haven't heard anything about this."

President Albrier: "I haven't either."

Councilman G. Frey: "The fact finder was hired by the Fire Fighters to do what that benefited all of the unions? Is that what the motion's about, Colleen? They did something that benefited everybody?"

Councilwoman Gallagher: "The fact finder was hired by Local 1145 because they were told that there was no money, you know, for them, and that the other two locals were not receiving any pay increase, or the directors. So when they went out and hired this person, the fact finder came back and said there was money. So I feel that since the fact finder, it benefited the other employees, because we're giving them a percent tonight, and I think that they should be reimbursed, because it's not fair to the Local 1145, because they're the ones who did hire this fact finder. So that's what I... I feel that they should be reimbursed."

Director Shaper: "Rich..."

President Albrier: "Yes Mr. Shaper."

Director Shaper: "I don't want to address the stated facts, because that is part of negotiation. I do want to say this. What Council does will be legal, whether they pay it, whether they don't pay it, whether they do it not to exceed. It is Council's option to go to a Finance meeting next time and discuss it. I'm not trying in any way to throw a hurdle in it, I'm just telling Council there are options."

President Albrier: "I understand."

Councilwoman Pucci: "May I be recognized?"

President Albrier: "Yes Mrs. Pucci."

Councilwoman Pucci: "It's in there not to exceed \$500, so I don't have a problem with it. And I do understand what you're trying to say, that the information that there was no money for raises was, I want to choose my words carefully, is stated as a reason, and now the other unions are getting a raise, because our financial picture has changed, and also, I think if everybody's honest, it's also in part because the Fire Fighters are getting 2%. So I would support this, and I don't see what the harm is, because we have a not to exceed in there, it's not like it's unlimited. Mr. Fisk, are you aware of what the actual cost would be?"

Clerk Fisk: "No, I'm not. And I just have a question for clarification. We're using the term fact finder, are we talking about their union representative?"

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Right, the mediator."

Clerk Fisk: "I just want to clarify that."

Councilman Coyne: "I see this as a just request and motion, to pay them basically for what they did for the whole city, actually."

Councilwoman Pucci: "So this is... What is the correct term? Would it be a mediator or..."

Clerk Fisk: "Well I believe that what you're talking about is their union representative. There was a mediator, but I don't think that's who you're talking about. I think you're talking about Mr. Astorini, who is their..."

Director Shaper: "Astorino."

Clerk Fisk: "...Astorino, who is their union rep."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Who would normally pay them? I mean, does he get paid by our local?"

Clerk Fisk: "The union, yes."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Okay. I don't know what..."

Mayor Patton: "But isn't that his job?"

President Albier: "I'm a little confused on that..."

Councilwoman Pucci: "I thought you were referring to the mediator."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "The mediator, that's what I am referring to, which I thought was the fact finder. That's what they call it."

Clerk Fisk: "Okay, that's what I was trying to make sure exactly what we were talking about."

President Albier: "So the mediator isn't connected to the union."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "No."

Clerk Fisk: "No, the mediator was Mr. Cline."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Right, and they had to pay him."

Clerk Fisk: "Okay, now, that's what I was just trying to make sure what we were talking about."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "So it's just a mediator fact finder..."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Is this split between... I'm sorry, go ahead."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "The mediator and fact finder, they call it the fact finder, other people call it the mediator. So..."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Is this something that the cost is split with the city already, or does the city pay half and the union pay half?"

Clerk Fisk: "I know that we have paid our portion of the bill. I really don't know..."

Councilwoman Pucci: "And what was our portion?"

Clerk Fisk: "...what their portion of the bill was. I believe ours was \$2100. So..."

Councilwoman Pucci: "And is it normally split 50/50?"

Clerk Fisk: "I've really never been on the other side."

Director Shaper: "I'd have to look at the documents, I don't know how that was split."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Okay."

Councilman J. Frey: "Why don't we hold this for the next Finance meeting and discuss it after we get the facts."

President Albier: "Otherwise it seems to me like the city's paying both sides of it."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Alright, that's fine."

President Albier: "Do you want to withdraw your motion and..."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "I'll withdraw my motion."

President Albier: "...we'll discuss it at the next Finance..."

Councilwoman Pucci: "We'll discuss it at the Finance meeting."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "At the Finance meeting, that's fine."

President Albier: "Okay, because I think there's a lot more questions. Alright, thank you Mrs. Gallagher."

Clerk Fisk: "Okay, do I have a..."

Councilman J. Frey: "You have a motion..."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Move to withdraw the motion."

President Albier: "The motion to withdraw."

Councilwoman Brown: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "Okay, so at this point we have a motion to suspend the rules on 40, I believe."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Yes."

President Albier: "Oh, we're going back to... Yes, yes. Okay."

Clerk Fisk: "So, on Ordinance 2005-40, to suspend the rules, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."

"Rich Albier."

"Kathy Pucci."

"Rita Brown."

"Colleen Gallagher."

"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."

Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."

Councilman Albier: "Yea."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."

Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."

Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Clerk Fisk: "To adopt Ordinance 2005-40, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."

"Rich Albier."

"Kathy Pucci."

"Rita Brown."

"Colleen Gallagher."

"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."

Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."

Councilman Albier: "Yea."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Abstain."

Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Abstain."

Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albrier: "**ORDINANCE 2005-43**, the third reading of the Temporary Appropriations. Need a motion."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Move to adopt."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To adopt Ordinance 2005-43, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albrier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albrier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albrier: "**ORDINANCE 2005-46**, the second reading, Amended Annual Appropriations."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Introduced by all, suspend the rules."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To suspend the rules, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albrier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albrier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Clerk Fisk: "To adopt Ordinance 2005-46, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albrier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albrier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albrier: "**ORDINANCE 2005-47** Amended. Authorizing the Mayor of the City of Brooklyn, Ohio to pay a 1% in additional compensation for 2005 to the City of Brooklyn Municipal Foremen and Laborers Union Local 1099."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Mr. Albrier, may I be recognized?"

President Albrier: "Yes Mrs. Gallagher."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Mr. Albrier, I'd like to make a motion to amend Ordinance 2005-47, Authorizing the Mayor to pay 2% in additional compensation for 2005 to the City of Brooklyn Municipal Foremen and Laborers Union Local 1099. The Fire Department received a 2% raise, and I do not believe this is fair, since our Laborers of Local 1099 have been working harder since we have not replaced retirees. So I make that motion."

Councilwoman Brown: "Second."

President Albrier: "Does anyone wish to comment?"

Mayor Patton: "I do."

Councilman G. Frey: "I do."

President Albrier: "Mr. Frey."

Councilman G. Frey: "I think it is very, very bad news for us at the Council to sit up here and start renegotiating contracts that are negotiated. The thing with the employees, the Fire Fighters in their 2% have assumed some of their health care costs, and there have been some other things put in there. You'd have to go through the whole contract to determine the value of that 2%, okay. I don't think it's right for us to sit up here at this meeting and do this. I think it's very, very wrong, very hurtful to the city, and I don't think it's really... You know, maybe it's fair to the employees, we're putting more money in the paycheck; but there's some things here that we need to protect from the end of the city's management that I don't... This certainly is not the place and time to do this right now, okay. I would object to that, and I couldn't vote for it."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Mr. Frey, it just says that to pay 1% in additional compensation for 2005. And I don't think there's anything wrong with giving our employees a 2% additional compensation. You know, I'm with the County, and we haven't got a raise, and I'm getting a 3% raise, and we never get a raise. So I really would, I feel that the Laborers of Local 1099 deserve this. And I'm all for it. And there's a second, and I'd like to take a vote."

Councilman J. Frey: "I think... Mr. Albrier."

President Albrier: "Wait, wait. Mr. Frey."

Councilman J. Frey: "I think we all feel the same way, we'd like to see these employees all get 5%. This isn't the place to start bringing that up. It's a great grandstanding approach. I think this should be discussed at a Finance meeting or discussed at a separate meeting of Council, and not discussed at a spur of the moment."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Well I'd like to take a vote."

Councilwoman Pucci: "May I be recognized Mr. Albrier?"

President Albrier: "Yes Mrs. Pucci."

Councilwoman Pucci: "A couple points. First of all, I said in the beginning of the year when we had concessions from two of our unions, that if other unions negotiated and got raises, I thought there would be a problem. Secondly, the health care with Fire Fighters begins in 2006, which, I believe, both of the city Service Department workers, correct me if I'm wrong, but I believe by extending their contract one year it expires December 31st of this year, right Mayor?"

Mayor Patton: "Correct."

Councilwoman Pucci: "So the Fire Fighters' change in their health care does not begin until 2006. The other point is, I don't believe this 1% additional compensation was a negotiated issue. I think we're giving it to them because our financial picture has changed, and also, I think, in part because the Fire Fighters did get the 2% through negotiation. Where do we stand with the police? Are we still in negotiations with them, or...?"

Mayor Patton: "We are in negotiations with all parties at this time."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Okay. And the 1% is approximately \$20,000 so the 2% would be \$40,000 for this particular group of employees. Thank you Mr. Albrier."

Director Shaper: "Rich, may I say something?"

President Albrier: "Yeah, I think the Mayor wanted to speak first though."

Mayor Patton: "We have signed contracts with Local 1099, Local 3218, and we're very grateful that the first group who said they would not take a raise in order to protect jobs is the non-union directors, chiefs, etc. It

was agreed to because it did save jobs. It was agreed to because they would not have to pay an employee contribution. So we have a signed contract agreement with all that's presented this evening, with the exception of the non-union and directors and chiefs. Changing the financial outlook at this time would mean a total reorganization of many things. Basically this is a very fine thank you for a job well done. The city did better than expected. We want to give back to our employees. And even though 1% is not, you know, up to par, that we think, but it is something over and above what the contract currently calls for. And again, we are currently in negotiations, and there are items that I will not discuss and should not be discussed here, so I just wanted to emphasize our commitment to our employees."

President Albier: "Mr. Shaper."

Director Shaper: "That's right along the lines of where I was going to go. That when you're negotiating with a number of unions whose job hours do not always correlate the same way, and you inherit contracts that are not always mirror images of each other, and you try and treat all unions fairly, there are going to be differences that one union perceives one way and another union perceives another. What was important at a point in time to a union, and I don't want to say too much about negotiation, was accomplished very well by the union representatives. However, the people that negotiated that at that point in time were all looking at a financial picture which proved not to be true. Now, we're going into union negotiations with several unions. There are already inherent difficulties when you're dealing with something. One thing that the administration was very concerned about was, while the negotiations are pending, we wanted the unions to be operating with a raise that started in 2005 and will continue into 2006 while we're negotiating. Where are things going to end up in 2006? I don't know. But one thing I do know was, you don't want to send a message to a union that if you, the best thing you can do is wait to see where the financial picture ends, or you're never going to get anybody to be the first one to go, to sign. And when it became apparent that the picture was better than anticipated, you don't sit there and say, look, we do not think you're entitled to that raise. It was agreed, look, here's a 1% unconditional, and to my knowledge people were pleased with it, in terms of the feedback that came back from the representatives. I don't want to say too much, but you have gone beyond what any legal obligation. The idea is, let's walk into the next negotiation with an understanding it's not unrecognized you were here when the city needed it. And in terms of where the other contracts with the Firemen go down the road, there are medical provisions that I don't know how the other unions are going to respond to those. There are similarities between contracts and there are differences. And if anyone in here thinks they can come up with a contract where everyone is going to be mirrored the same and perceived to be the same, I'm willing to listen to anybody's advice. I do know that acting as a group together, which we are, whether we like to admit it at times or don't like to admit it at times, we do represent the represents of the City of Brooklyn. The idea of let's pull out a new idea on the floor and make people make a decision on the spot, or be perceived as I'm pulling away 1% or I'm giving 1%, this was done with the idea that the administration, with Council, together would give more than they were legally obligated to, but ethically felt was correct. And next time we come into a negotiation people will realize, hey, if things change the city's not unreasonable. And that's where it was meant, it's been in people's folders for four weeks. It didn't take anybody by surprise, it's been here."

President Albier: "Thank you Mr. Shaper. Does anyone else wish to comment?"

Councilman Coyne: "Mr. Albier."

President Albier: "Mr. Coyne."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you. As our Law Director said, he believes in fairness to all our employees, union and non-union, and this appears to be a fairness approach, because we are giving the Fire Fighters the 2% and we're saying to the 1099, the Service Department workers, and the AFSCME 3218, it's kind of like you're second citizens, you're only worth half of what the Fire Department is? I don't buy that."

President Albier: "Anyone else?"

Councilman J. Frey: "Yes."

President Albier: "Mr. Frey."

Councilman J. Frey: "The people that pay for this are those retirees and residents that pay the taxes. And everybody out in Brooklyn is in pretty rough shape thinking of their heating bills right now. I have no fault with giving anybody another 1% raise. This is the wrong way to do it. It's just taking people's tax money and the Council say we're going to give more here, going to give more there, when these contracts have already been set. And I feel it's wrong for us to go now and change the intent of the negotiation that was settled. I don't approve."

President Albier: "Thank you Mr. Frey."

Councilwoman Pucci: "May I make just one more comment?"

President Albier: "Yes."

Councilwoman Pucci: "I think it's pretty difficult with about a \$1.8 million carry-over in the General Fund to say that we can't come up with an additional \$20,000 to make the Service Garage workers percentage-wise even with what the Fire Fighters negotiated."

Councilman J. Frey: "Well the service workers don't have many employees on Council as the Fire Department does."

Councilman Coyne: "No, no, that's..."

President Albier: "Mr. Shaper."

Director Shaper: "If we're doing this on the open floor, which I'm not in favor of, I do want to ask Council, assuming you give the 2%, do you think that the Fire Fighters will perceive that they have been treated equally to the Service and AFSCME workers? And if they are not, will it end there?"

Councilwoman Pucci: "I'm not sure what your question is."

Director Shaper: "What I'm saying is, assume that Service workers and AFSCME workers are given the 2%, do you perceive that the Fire Department will perceive that they have been treated equally to the Service Department and the AFSCME workers?"

Councilwoman Pucci: "Are you asking one of us or all of us?"

Director Shaper: "I'm asking anybody to weigh in and just look big picture as to where this is going. Because it was brought out... You're welcome to do what you want, but this is your decision, and I don't want anyone to think it's stemming from within negotiations. I believe there were already be hard feelings about the 1% there, and since you brought it out in the open floor I'm just making you aware of that."

President Albier: "Okay, thank you Mr. Shaper."

Councilwoman Brown: "Are you indicating that the Fire Fighters are more prestigious than the Service workers?"

Director Shaper: "I'm not indicating that any person on this planet's more worthy of anything than anybody else."

Councilwoman Brown: "I should hope not."

President Albier: "My thought on this is, I think every Councilman up here would like to give as much money as they could to all the workers. But I have a problem with this because we've had it in our packet for three weeks, we've had three Finance meetings where it could have been discussed, and to bring it up and try to change everything at the last minute, I don't like that. Does anyone else have anything they wish to say before we vote?"

Councilman Coyne: "Yes."

President Albrier: "Mr. Coyne."

Councilman Coyne: "Thank you. I think this is based on the carry-over, the surpluses we have in the budget, and the small amounts that this 1% is going to add 20,000 or 6,000 additional dollars per year for the whole group. It seems like a very small amount considering when you consider the large amount of surplus we have. I think that's what the basis of this is about, the surpluses that weren't expected, which originally brought out the 1%."

President Albrier: "Thank you."

Councilman G. Frey: "When we talk... Rich, may I be recognized?"

President Albrier: "Yes Mr. Frey."

Councilman G. Frey: "When we talk about surpluses that we're carrying over, let's not assume that that's play money that we get to throw around however we want. It's not. It's what carries us forward against the bad times, okay. It's our rainy day funds. If something bad happens, this is what keeps us from the wolf's door. If we dissipate it we've made a mistake, okay. We need some carry-over. Maybe we don't need 1.850 million, maybe we don't need 1.9 million. I think we probably do. I think prudent financial planning would indicate that if we run it down much below that we're taking a risk with the services, the benefits and everything else that we offer you. Now, to be perfectly honest, from the start of the year when we first talked with our, the people at the garage, and the people that work here in City Hall, and the directors and what not, and asked them to take a zero percent wage in order to protect the jobs and protect the hospitalizations and what not, from the beginning. And I talked to Mrs. Pucci about this. I was of the mind that if we did get into a situation where we had funds and contracts were negotiated elsewhere, we needed to try and do what we can to make our employees whole, okay. And I don't know what the number is, 1%, 2%, but I'm not going to sit here at a Council meeting, first time I'm hearing this, and say, well okay, let's do 2%. Should we get into a bidding war? Somebody want to go 3%, 4%, 5%? That's just not right, okay. We have collective bargaining agreements. We ran into a tough time last, at the beginning of this year. We were very nervous, okay? Our income tax collections had dropped for two years running, Mr. Fisk? We didn't know what was going to happen this year. We didn't know the economy was going to snap back in Brooklyn a little bit. In fact, we're thinking American Greetings was going to cut some jobs and our income tax was going to drop maybe a little more this year. And instead it turned around, and we rebounded, and we should be very grateful for that. And we need to do something for our employees. But if the Council is going to take over the negotiation of contracts on the Council floor, I don't want any part of it. I think that is just terrible, terribly wrong."

President Albrier: "Mr. Fisk."

Dir. Fisk: "I rarely speak in this situation, but I feel I need to at least say something here. We recognized at the beginning of the year that we were probably going to be in a different situation with all of our unions in negotiations. And there was consideration given on the part of the acceptance of the zero percent. The firemen are not in the same situation as were the Service Garage or AFSCME. At the particular times we were looking at hopefully saving some jobs, there was consideration given. And in this particular situation all we're trying to do is somewhat match up those differences, give a 1% for the recognition of the fact that these two unions and the non-union folks did work with us. But we will be addressing the full situation in union negotiations that have already started with both of these unions. Therefore it's pretty tough for me to go through and talk about the differences in consideration, but there were differences in consideration. And at this point trying to match them up and saying they're all the same and should be treated the same really doesn't match up with the negotiations that took place at the time. And that's the only point I wanted to make. Thank you."

President Albrier: "Thank you Mr. Fisk. Anyone else?"

Councilwoman Pucci: "May I be recognized?"

President Albrier: "Mrs. Pucci."

Councilwoman Pucci: "First of all, this is the first I'm hearing about it also. But I can't remember a time in recent history, and I'm including before I got on Council, where the employees did not receive the same percentage raises. And also, what you said Greg about Council negotiating, I have absolutely no interest in trying to interfere in that process. I believe this ordinance is just giving the 1% additional compensation to those employees because our financial picture has changed dramatically from what we thought it was going to be at the beginning of the year. Thank you."

President Albrier: "Mayor."

Mayor Patton: "Just remember, carry-over is used for things such as the escalating cost of gas to heat our city buildings. We have fleets that are using gas which is costing 2.50, 2.15, whatever the cost is. It's very inflated compared to what it used to be. We have a fleet of fire and ambulances, a fleet of police cars and fleets down at the Service Garage, along with running a Rec Center. So there's many things. We look into our crystal ball and try to forecast the best we can, and when you can put a few bucks away, that's what you do."

President Albrier: "Anyone else? Okay, call for a vote Mr. Fisk."

Clerk Fisk: "To amend Ordinance 2005-47 from 1% additional compensation to 2% additional compensation, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."

"Rich Albrier."

"Kathy Pucci."

"Rita Brown."

"Colleen Gallagher."

"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."

Councilman J. Frey: "No."

Councilman Albrier: "No."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."

Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."

Councilman G. Frey: "No."

Clerk Fisk: "The amendment passes 4-3."

President Albrier: "We have to vote on it now, to pass it. We need a motion to vote on 2005-47 as amended to the 2%."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Do we need the, introduced by all, suspend the rules."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To suspend the rules on Ordinance 2005-47, as amended, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."

"Rich Albrier."

"Kathy Pucci."

"Rita Brown."

"Colleen Gallagher."

"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."

Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."

Councilman Albrier: "Yea."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."

Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."

Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Clerk Fisk: "To approve Ordinance 2005-47, as amended, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."

"Rich Albrier."

"Kathy Pucci."

"Rita Brown."

"Colleen Gallagher."

"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."

Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."

Councilman Albrier: "No."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."

Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."

Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albrier: "**ORDINANCE 2005-48.** Authorizing the Mayor of the City of Brooklyn to pay 1% in additional compensation for 2005 to the City of Brooklyn AFSCME Ohio Council 8 AFL-CIO Local 1018."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Mr. Albier, may I be recognized?"

President Albier: "Yes."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "I'd like to make a motion to amend Ordinance 2005-48, Authorizing the Mayor to pay 2% in additional compensation for 2005 to the City of Brooklyn AFSCME Ohio Council 8 AFL-CIO Local 3218, because I also think it is fair that they get the same compensation as the Fire Fighters and our Local Foreman's union."

Councilwoman Brown: "Second."

President Albier: "Before we vote on this ordinance, I had Local 1018, and it's supposed to be Local 3218."

Clerk Fisk: "To amend Ordinance 2005-48 to pay 2% additional compensation in lieu of 1%, and to Union 3218, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "No."
Councilman Albier: "No."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea, just with a comment. That would be \$6,000. And that's a year. No, 6,000 is the additional percent."

Mayor Patton: "Right, right, total of 12."

Clerk Fisk: "Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "No."

Clerk Fisk: "The amendment passes 4-3."

President Albier: "Need a motion."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Introduced by all, suspend the rules."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To suspend the rules on Ordinance 2005-48, as amended, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Clerk Fisk: "To adopt Ordinance 2005-48, as amended, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "No."
Councilman Albier: "No."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albier: "**ORDINANCE 2005-49**, Amended. Authorizing the Mayor of the City of Brooklyn, Ohio to pay 1% in additional compensation for 2005 to the positions of Civil Service Commission, Building Commissioner, Director of Public Service, General Foreman, Fire Chief, Chief of Police, Recreation Manager,

Coordinator of Senior Services, Administrative Assistant to the Mayor, Executive Secretary to the Mayor, Director of Law, Mayor's Court Magistrate, and Prosecutor and Finance Director."

Councilwoman Brown: "Discussion."

President Albier: "Mrs. Brown."

Councilwoman Brown: "Thank you Mr. Albier. I have a big problem with this ordinance. I personally feel that we have, for our small city of 11,500 residents, very well paid directors. Very well paid directors. In the category of the 80,000s. Now they are mixed in with all these, with lower paid people. I would like to point out... Well, for one thing, I don't know why the Civil Service Commission should receive additional monies. The Building Commissioner is in the 80,000 bracket. Director of Public Service is in the 80,000 bracket. But the General Foreman, I don't know what he earns, but it's not \$80,000. Fire Chief, Chief of Police, \$80,000 bracket. The Assistant to the Mayor, have no idea what she earns. The Executive Secretary to the Mayor, have no idea what she earns. Director of Law, I don't know what he earns. Mayor's Court Magistrate, I know is underpaid. Prosecutor and Finance Director, Finance Director's up in the 80,000s. And I do believe lumped in here is the Coordinator of Senior Services, which whom I believe is underpaid. This ordinance is a mish-mosh. Unfortunately I won't be able to vote for an increase because of the highly paid directors that we already have. And I'm sure they're not all going to be talking to me after tonight, but that's too bad. I do believe that they are overpaid. And that's all I have to say on this ordinance."

President Albier: "Anyone else care to speak?"

Councilwoman Pucci: "May I be recognized?"

President Albier: "Mrs. Pucci."

Councilwoman Pucci: "In the first whereas, we need to strike 2005 and insert 2004. And also in Section 1, the second line, we have to do the same thing, 'base pay earned in 2005' and change that to 2004."

President Albier: "Okay. Anyone else care to speak? We need a motion for this, as amended."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Do we have to vote on the amendment first?"

Councilwoman Brown: "I don't think anybody introduced it."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Where it says, 'named personnel agree to extend their 2005 payroll rates', we need to change that to 2004."

Clerk Fisk: "Okay, and where is the second one?"

Councilwoman Pucci: "Section 1, 'Be it ordained... the base pay...'"

Clerk Fisk: "Actually that one doesn't..."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Oh, that would be okay because that would be the same?"

Clerk Fisk: "Yeah, that doesn't need changed."

Councilwoman Pucci: "So just going to change in the first whereas, we're going to strike 2005 and insert 2004. And I move we amend that."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To amend Ordinance 2005-49 to change the first whereas from 2005 to 2004, Tom Coyne."

Councilman Coyne: "Yeah."

"John Frey."

Councilman J. Frey: "Yeah."

"Rich Albier."

Councilman Albier: "Yeah."

"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albrier: "I need a motion to adopt."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Introduced by all, suspend the rules, as amended. Was there a second?"

President Albrier: "I'll second that."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To suspend the rules on Ordinance 2005-49, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."
"Rich Albrier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"And Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albrier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "No."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Clerk Fisk: "To adopt 2005-49, as amended, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."
"Rich Albrier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albrier: "Abstain."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "No."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albrier: **"2005-50.** Authorizing the Mayor to enter into an agreement with the Local Government Services Division of the State Auditor's Office to provide services to the City of Brooklyn."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Introduced by all, suspend the rules."

Councilwoman Gallagher: "Second."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To suspend the rules, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."
"Rich Albrier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albrier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Clerk Fisk: "To adopt Ordinance 2005-51, excuse me, 50, Tom Coyne." Councilman Coyne: "Yea."

"John Frey."
"Rich Albrier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albrier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albrier: **"ORDINANCE 2005-51.** An Ordinance authorizing inter-fund transfers and advances during 2005."

Councilman Coyne: "Introduced by all..."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Introduced by all, suspend the rules."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To suspend the rules, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Clerk Fisk: "To adopt, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albier: "**ORDINANCE 2005-52.** Authorizing the execution of a Master Tax exempt lease/purchase agreement between Key Municipal Finance, a division of the Key Corporation Capital, Inc., as lessor, and the City of Brooklyn, as lessee."

Councilman Coyne: "Introduced by all, suspend the rules."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Introduced by all, suspend the rules."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To suspend the rules, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Clerk Fisk: "To adopt, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albier: "**ORDINANCE 2005-54.** An Ordinance establishing fees for the teams registering to compete in the adult softball league through the Brooklyn Recreation Department."

Councilman Coyne: "Introduced by all, suspend the rules."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To suspend the rules, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."

"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Clerk Fisk: "To adopt, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albier: "**ORDINANCE 2005-51 (55)**, to put on first reading. Enacting Chapter 1360 of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Brooklyn, Ohio entitled Chapter 1360 Property Maintenance and Rental Licensing Code."

Councilman Coyne: "It's number 55."

Councilwoman Pucci: "It's 55."

Clerk Fisk: "55."

President Albier: "I'm sorry, 2005-55."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Move to put on first reading."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Councilwoman Pucci: "May I be recognized Mr. Albier?"

President Albier: "Yes."

Councilwoman Pucci: "I just wanted to mention that when we meet at our Organizational meeting we are going to schedule a public hearing on this ordinance."

Clerk Fisk: "To place Ordinance 2005-55 on first reading, Tom Coyne."

"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

President Albier: "Does anyone else have anything they wish to state before Council?"

Councilman G. Frey: "Rich, could I, one thing?"

President Albier: "Yes."

Councilman G. Frey: "I think we all got sent something from Dominion East Ohio on the winter heating bill assistant programs. Did you get this? I think we ought to have copies of this around City Hall for residents that come in looking for maybe some help, okay, that we could give them this."

Mayor Patton: "Okay."

Councilwoman Pucci: "And the Senior Center too."

Councilman G. Frey: "Yeah."

Councilwoman Pucci: "Maybe even the Rec Center."

Councilman J. Frey: "I'll move we adjourn."

Councilman Coyne: "Second."

Clerk Fisk: "To adjourn, Tom Coyne."
"John Frey."
"Rich Albier."
"Kathy Pucci."
"Rita Brown."
"Colleen Gallagher."
"Greg Frey."

Councilman Coyne: "Yea."
Councilman J. Frey: "Yea."
Councilman Albier: "Yea."
Councilwoman Pucci: "Yea."
Councilwoman Brown: "Yea."
Councilwoman Gallagher: "Yea."
Councilman G. Frey: "Yea."

Meeting adjourned at 8:43 p.m.

Clerk of Council

MAYOR